

Benedetto Marzullo (2000). *Scripta Minora I and II*. (Spudasmata, 77.) (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag) DM 296. Pp. xxxviii+1-466, viii+467-999.

Alan H. Sommerstein
CADRE
University of Nottingham
alan.sommerstein@nottingham.ac.uk

Every scholar with a speciality in Greek poetry – and above all in Greek comedy – will have come across some aspect of the work of Benedetto Marzullo; and most scholars working on Greek texts, especially those preparing editions, will have had repeated occasion to consult the journal *Museum Criticum*, which he founded in 1966 as *Quaderni dell'Istituto di Filologia Greca dell'Università di Cagliari*, which moved with him first to Bologna and then to Rome, and which has sadly come to an end with volume XXXII-XXXV (1997-2000). Marzullo himself, according to the bibliography presented here (vol. I, pp.xxvii-xxxvi), contributed no less than 108 articles to *MCr* (101 more than the present reviewer).

It is thus very welcome that this selection, edited by six of his pupils, should have been published of his articles and essays, both on classical philology and on a wide range of other topics, spanning more than half a century of activity. It contains 37 articles on Greek language and literature (plus two book reviews, and the introductions to Marzullo's translations of the comedies of Aristophanes and of Menander's *Dyskolos*); 19 on other subjects ranging from the decipherment of Linear B (a radio talk) to the authenticity of a document said to be the work of the murdered Italian statesman Aldo Moro while held prisoner; and 54 short pieces (all dating from 1972 or later), largely from the daily press, some betraying a very strong political commitment (I am not sure whether the editors were well advised to reproduce the paean in honour of "Athens-on-Spree", alias East Berlin, to be found on pp.966-9). The longer articles are reproduced photographically in their original typography, but rather inconveniently their original pagination (which could easily have been inserted in square brackets in the corners of pages) will be found only in the "Indice delle Fonti" at the end of the second volume. In the field of Greek language and literature, we are given four pieces on Homer, seven on lyric poetry, nine each on comedy and tragedy, three on Hippocratic texts, and nine on lexicography ancient and modern. An introduction by the editors explains the significance of each selected item, or group of items, for the total picture of Marzullo's scholarship and thought, and his long-time friend Winfried Bühler contributes a foreword.

Any selected edition of *Kleine Schriften* is going to disappoint some – perhaps all – readers, precisely because it is a selection. On the one hand, the question arises: is one to choose items for their quality, or concentrate on those which might otherwise be difficult of access? The editors have clearly opted for the former alternative, and one understands why; at the same time, one may feel it is a pity that only twenty articles from *MCr* have been included, since the journal is *rara avis* in many lands (in British academic libraries it seems not to exist outside Oxford, Cambridge and London). On the other hand, in a selection which rightly tries to cover all the areas of Marzullo's activity, everyone will feel that their own speciality is under-represented. As it happens, this reviewer has that feeling in a particularly acute form: of nearly forty articles Marzullo has published on Old Comedy (mainly Aristophanes and Cratinus), only three appear in these volumes. The two chosen to represent Aristophanes,

however, are certainly among Marzullo's most important contributions to the study of this author; both tackle the difficult problem of identifying speakers in dramatic scripts which, in their earliest form, did not indicate in any systematic and unambiguous way what words were spoken by what character, and each seeks to increase the coherence and unity of a play by increasing the prominence of its central personage. "L'interlocuzione negli 'Uccelli' di Aristofane" (1970; pp.198-211), building on earlier arguments by Eduard Fraenkel (*Beobachtungen zu Aristophanes* [Rome, 1962] 61-65), made a convincing case, against the consensus of ancient scholars and of modern editors, for giving Peisetaerus, the hero of *Birds*, the leading role in the early scenes of the play – and also for calling him Peisetaerus (one who persuades his comrades) rather than Peithetaerus (one who obeys his comrades) or Pisthetaerus (the faithful comrade). "L' 'esodo' della *Lysistrata*" [*sic*; throughout the article the play is named in Latin and the character in Italian] (1977; pp.212-224) established – against the authority of Wilamowitz, and against the feminist dogma that a male Athenian poet, writing for an essentially male audience, could not have ended a comedy with a woman exercising beneficent authority over men – that the commanding role in the final scene of *Lysistrata* is taken, not by an anonymous "prytanis" or "Athenian delegate", but by Lysistrata herself. Neither of these proposals has won the support it deserves from subsequent scholarship; perhaps their republication will encourage specialists to examine the arguments again.

These volumes will make a splendid monument to Marzullo's contribution to scholarship and to culture.